



2016 Business Assistance Report

Report to the Legislature

Summary of Business and Financial Assistance Reported
By State and Local Government Agencies Provided Between
July 1, 1995 and December 31, 2015
In Accordance With
Minnesota Statutes § 116J.993 through § 116J.995

(Appendices Available Under Separate Cover)

December 2016

Edwin Hodder
Economic Analyst
Economic Analysis Unit
Minnesota Department of Employment and Economic Development

Total cost of salaries, printing, and supplies in
developing/preparing this report is \$27,113.84
(reported as required by Minn. Stat. 3.197)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
Introduction.....	1
Data Collection	1
Overview.....	2
Overview of Non-JOBZ Findings.....	3
2015 Activity Findings	11
Appendices (under separate cover)	
Appendix A: Listing of Agencies Required to Submit a 2016 MBAF	
Appendix B: Summary of 2015 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix C: Summary of 2014 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix D: Summary of 2013 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix E: Summary of 2012 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix F: Summary of 2011 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix G: Summary of 2010 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix H: Summary of 2009 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix I: Summary of 2008 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix J: Summary of 2007 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix K: Summary of 2006 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix L: Summary of 2005 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix M: Summary of 2004 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix N: Summary of 2003 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix O: Summary of 2002 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix P: Summary of 2001 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix Q: Summary of 2000 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix R: Summary of 1999 (August 1 - December 31, 1999) Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix S: Summary of July 1, 1995 - July 31, 1999 Non-JOBZ Business Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016	
Appendix T: Listing of Agencies that Held a Public Hearing and Adopted Criteria Per M.S. 116J.993 - M.S. 116J.995	
Appendix U: Summary of August 1, 1999 - December 31, 2015 Business Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies that Failed to Fulfill all Goals and Obligations in 2000 through 2015	
Appendix V: Summary of August 1, 1999 – December 31, 2015 Business Assistance Agreements that were Terminated by Government Agencies in 2000 through 2016	

2016 JOBZ BUSINESS ASSISTANCE REPORT

Introduction

The business subsidy law, Minnesota Statutes §116J.993 through §116J.995, provides a mechanism for taxpayers to learn about state and local funds used for business subsidies and financial assistance. The law applies to state and local government agencies with the authority to provide business subsidies including Job Opportunity Building Zone (JOBZ) and financial assistance. Grantors are required to submit a Minnesota Business Assistance Form (MBAF) to the Minnesota Department of Employment and Economic Development (DEED) for each agreement signed since July 1, 1995 for two years after the benefit date or until all goals are met, whichever is later.

Under the law, local government agencies in communities with a population of more than 2,500 and state agencies with authority to grant subsidies must submit a report to DEED, regardless of whether they have awarded business subsidies. Local government agencies in communities with a population of 2,500 or less are exempt from filing the MBAF unless they have awarded a subsidy in the past five years. Of the 648 state and local government agencies that were required to file in 2016 either because of population size, previous business subsidy activity or current activity in 2015, 298 agencies (46.0 percent) submitted a MBAF and 350 agencies (54.0 percent) did not submit a form (Appendix A). DEED is required to complete a report that summarizes submitted MBAFs every even-numbered year.

Forms summarized in this report are primarily reported by local government agencies and are primarily local aid. Examples of local aid include loans, grants, tax abatements and tax increment financing. Some, but not all, state subsidies are captured in this report but are only reflected if the local entity receiving the subsidy submits their report. Minnesota Investment Fund loans, Minnesota Job Creation, and Greater Minnesota Expansion Program funds provided by DEED and reported by local government agencies are also summarized.

State government agencies are also required to report if they have the authority to award business subsidies. Eligible business assistance loans and grants reported from the Minnesota Department of Agriculture, Minnesota Agricultural and Economic Development Board, Iron Range Resources and Rehabilitation Board, and Minnesota Rural Finance Authority are summarized in this report. Public facilities funding programs, flood recovery funding programs, housing financing, federal loan funds and angel tax credits are not subject to business subsidy reporting. DEED monitors and reports on all agency-run programs, and the annual program summaries can be found at DEED's website located at mn.gov/deed/about/what-we-do/agency-results/program-summaries/index.jsp.

Data Collection

Reports can be filed to DEED by mailing a hard copy or using the new online application launched in 2016. Because reporting requirements changed in 1999, for business assistance agreements entered into by agencies between July 1, 1995 and July 31, 1999, agencies use the 1999 MBAF to fulfill reporting requirements. For agreements entered between August 1, 1999 and December 31, 2015, agencies use the standard MBAF form. A separate form is now required for financial assistance of \$25,000 and greater that is excluded from the definition of "business subsidy" by Minnesota Statutes §116J.993, subdivision 3, clause (1), and of business

loans and loan guarantees from \$75,000 and \$150,000 for agreements signed on or after January 1, 2008. For agreements prior to that period agencies use the standard MBAF form.

A separate JOBZ MBAF reporting form was developed to address recommendations in the 2008 JOBZ Program Evaluation Report from the Office of the Legislative Auditor. One report summarizing JOBZ MBAF activity in CY 2015 will be available by December 2016.

Forms summarized cover non-JOBZ business assistance agreements reached between July 1, 1995 and December 31, 2015 and financial assistance agreements reached between July 1, 1995 and December 31, 2007 that were submitted to DEED by June 1, 2016. These forms and forms submitted by government agencies after June 1, 2016 are available on DEED's website. The report includes all forms received by September 30, 2016.

The report also summarizes program activity for the Minnesota Job Creation Fund for projects designated between CY 2014 and CY 2015. This program provides financial benefits to expanding businesses in eligible industries. Businesses are also required to spend at least \$500,000 in real property improvements within one year and to create at least 10 new full-time positions within two years. All financing is performance-based and is provided after the business meets capital investment and job creation thresholds. No program dollars are disbursed until the business submits evidence of qualifying capital investment and job creation to DEED.

The report also summarizes program activity for the Minnesota Job Expansion program for projects approved between CY 2014 and CY 2015. This program provides tax benefits to businesses located in Greater Minnesota that increase employment by two employees or ten percent, whichever is greater. Approved businesses that meet job growth and compensation goals receive a refund for any sales tax paid for purchases made during a seven-year period. The program is for businesses with sales and customers primarily outside of Minnesota.

Overview

Because the statute requires DEED to track each individual project awarded, grantors are required to submit information annually for each project for two years or until each project achieves its goals, whichever is later. Grantors (local and state government agencies) are responsible for reporting and updating their business and financial assistance projects as required by the business subsidy law.

DEED also sends postcards annually to grantors to remind them to report on eligible business and financial assistance and previously reported assistance until all goals and obligations are met.¹ In 2015, DEED sent out letters to each grantor to report on any outstanding business and financial assistance projects between July 1, 1995 and December 31, 2013. DEED received updates on 103 projects. Goals were met for more than 25 of them and project status was updated on an additional 44 projects. DEED will continue to send out letters during non-reporting years for any past-due projects.

¹For recipients that have not yet met all their obligations stipulated in their business and financial assistance agreements, there are several reasons why this may occur. First, the recipient may have more time to meet its goals and obligations stipulated in their agreement. Recipients or businesses have two years from the benefit date to meet specific wage and job goals and in some cases local government agencies may have a five-year requirement to remain on the premises where the subsidy is provided. Also in the case of TIF or tax abatement, like JOBZ projects, recipients are required to report for the duration of the TIF or tax abatement which may be as long as 10 to 12 years from the benefit date. Second, some projects may not have been updated for several years due to staffing changes at local government agencies. Reporting on these projects may be delayed even after receiving a notice from DEED.

This report summarizes business subsidy agreements signed in 2015. Agreements signed in previous years are updated and summarized in Appendices (B-V).

Business assistance activity has varied significantly from year to year as reported by state and local government agencies. Non-JOBZ activity peaked in 2000 with 196 agreements, falling to 20 agreements in 2013.

Overview of Non-JOBZ Findings

The activity levels and total value of non-JOBZ business assistance have varied significantly from year to year as reported by state and local government agencies. Twenty non-JOBZ business assistance agreements were reported by government agencies in 2016 for 2009 activity, compared to 196 agreements for 2000 activity. The total value of business assistance agreements has also varied significantly from year to year, from a total value of \$610.6 million for 2000 activity to \$13.9 million for 2008 activity (Table 1).

TABLE 1
Activity Levels and Total Value of Non-JOBZ Business Assistance
Reached Between July 1, 1995 and December 31, 2013

Activity Period	Activity Levels	Total Value (in millions)
January 1, 2015 – December 31, 2015	22	\$14.0
January 1, 2014 – December 31, 2014	27	\$24.3
January 1, 2013 – December 31, 2013	26	\$18.5
January 1, 2012 – December 31, 2012	45	\$41.9
January 1, 2011 – December 31, 2011	39	\$25.8
January 1, 2010 – December 31, 2010	29	\$20.0
January 1, 2009 – December 31, 2009	20	\$27.0
January 1, 2008 – December 31, 2008	23	\$13.9
January 1, 2007 – December 31, 2007	66	\$45.3
January 1, 2006 – December 31, 2006	61	\$28.9
January 1, 2005 – December 31, 2005	91	\$66.9
January 1, 2004 – December 31, 2004	91	\$28.8
January 1, 2003 – December 31, 2003	100	\$38.0
January 1, 2002 – December 31, 2002	135	\$35.9
January 1, 2001 – December 31, 2001	170	\$103.4
January 1, 2000 – December 31, 2000	196	\$610.6
August 1, 1999 – December 31, 1999	72	\$17.5
July 1, 1995 – July 31, 1999	393	\$174.3
Totals	1,606	\$1,335.0

2015 Non-JOBZ Activity

Of the 648 state and local government agencies required to file in 2016 either because of population size, previous business subsidy activity or current activity in 2015, 298 agencies submitted a MBAF and 350 agencies did not submit a form (Appendix A).

Of the 298 agencies that submitted a form, 15 agencies reported on 22 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015. The \$14.0 million of business assistance provided by those 22 agreements ranged from a \$156,000 tax increment subsidy to a \$1.9 million tax increment subsidy.

Of the 22 business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015, four recipients (18.2 percent) had achieved stipulated goals and obligations, compared to 18 recipients (81.8 percent) that have yet to achieve goals and obligations. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the four

agreements was \$2.8 million (20.3 percent) compared to \$11.2 million (79.7 percent) that had yet to achieve goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$14.0 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2015 activity on 29 eligible financial assistance projects where the assistance was at or less than \$150,000. Of the 29 financial assistance projects reached by government agencies between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015, 12 recipients (41.4 percent) had achieved all goals compared to 17 recipients (58.6 percent) that have yet to meet their obligations. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the 12 projects was \$1.1 million (46.4 percent) compared to \$1.2 million (53.6 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of public financial assistance was \$2.3 million. The project budget for those 29 projects totaled \$17.9 million of which \$2.3 million (12.6 percent) was provided by the public.

Businesses reported to DEED in 2016 for 2015 activity on 26 Job Creation Fund projects. Of the 26 Job Creation Fund agreements reached by businesses between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015, they reported 1,963 projected new full-time jobs compared to 820 actual new full-time jobs. The projected average hourly wage excluding benefits was \$22.40 with a projected average benefit of \$5.08. The total projected hourly wage was \$27.48. The actual average hourly wage excluding benefits was \$24.83 with an actual average benefit of \$5.82. The total average hour wage was \$30.37. Businesses reported projected total project costs of \$230.2 million compared to \$114.4 million of actual eligible project costs. The job creation amount award was \$7.0 million and the capital investment rebate award was \$5.3 million for a total job creation amount of \$12.3 million.

Businesses reported to DEED in 2016 for 2015 on three Greater Minnesota Job Expansion projects. Of the three projects approved between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015, businesses reported 11 projected full-time equivalent jobs to be created within three years at the facility compared with 17.5 jobs to date. The projected average hourly wage including benefits was \$18.85. The actual average hourly wage including benefits was \$17.54. There are two projects where the verification of the actual wages is in progress. Businesses reported total projected sales tax paid for purchases during a seven-year period of \$8.1 million and a total value of the seven-year refund of \$383,007 (Appendix B).

2014 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2014 activity on 27 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2014 and December 31, 2014. Eleven recipients (40.7 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to 16 recipients (59.3 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the 11 agreements that met all goals was \$5.9 million (24.3 percent) compared to \$18.4 million (75.7 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$24.3 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2014 activity on two eligible financial assistance agreements in excess of \$150,000. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of financial assistance was \$.07 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2014 activity on 11 eligible financial assistance projects where the assistance was at or less than \$150,000 reached by government agencies between January 1, 2014 and December 31, 2014. Six recipients (54.5 percent) had achieved all stated goals compared to five recipients (45.5 percent) that have yet to meet all of their

obligations. The total value of the six projects was \$0.5 million (59.4 percent), compared to \$0.4 million (40.4 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of public financial assistance was \$0.9 million. The project budget for those 11 projects totaled \$8.8 million of which 0.9 million (9.7 percent) was provided by the public.

Businesses reported to DEED in 2016 for 2014 activity on 23 designated Job Creation Fund projects reached by businesses between January 1, 2014 and December 31, 2014. They reported 1,082 projected new full-time jobs compared to 517 actual new full-time jobs. The projected average hourly wage excluding benefits was \$22.11 with a projected average benefit of \$6.48. The total projected hourly wage was \$28.59. The actual average hourly wage excluding benefits was \$21.92 with an actual average benefit of \$5.62. The total average hourly wage was \$26.35. Businesses reported project total costs of \$243.3 million compared to \$103.7 million of eligible project costs. The job creation amount awarded was \$5.8 million and the capital investment rebate award was \$5.4 million for a total job creation amount of \$11.2 million.

Businesses reported to DEED in 2016 for 2014 on two Greater Minnesota Job Expansion projects approved for businesses between January 1, 2014 and December 31, 2014. Businesses reported seven projected full-time equivalent jobs to be created within three years at the facility compared with 10 jobs to date. The projected average hourly wage including benefits was \$14.50. The actual average hourly wage including benefits was \$14.88. Businesses reported total projected sales tax paid for purchases during a seven-year period of \$2.2 million and a total value of the seven-year refund of \$150,000 (Appendix C).

2013 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2013 activity that there were 26 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2013 and December 31, 2013. Twenty-one recipients (80.8 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to five recipients (19.2 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the 21 agreements that met all goals was \$14.6 million (78.7 percent) compared to \$3.9 million (21.3 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$18.5 million.

A government agency reported in 2016 for 2013 activity on one eligible financial assistance project in excess of \$150,000. The agency reported that the recipient had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the financial assistance was \$0.3 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2013 activity on 13 eligible financial assistance projects where the assistance was at or less than \$150,000 reached by government agencies between January 1, 2013 and December 31, 2013. Six recipients (46.2 percent) had achieved all state goals compared to seven (53.8 percent) that have yet to meet all of their obligations. The total value of the six projects that met all goals was \$0.6 million (50.6 percent), compared to \$0.6 million (49.4 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of public financial assistance was \$1.2 million. The project budget of those 13 projects totaled \$18.6 million of which \$1.2 million (16.6 percent) was provided by the public (Appendix D).

2012 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2012 activity on 45 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2012 and December 31, 2012. Twenty-five recipients

(55.6 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to 20 recipients (44.4 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the 25 agreements that met all goals was \$27.2 million (65.0 percent) compared to \$14.7 million (35.0 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$41.9 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2012 activity on two eligible financial assistance agreements in excess of \$150,000. One recipient (50.0 percent) had achieved all goals and obligations; one recipient (50.0 percent) had yet to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the project that met all goals was \$0.3 million (26.4 percent) compared to \$1.0 million (73.6 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2012 activity on 27 eligible financial assistance projects where the assistance was at or less than \$150,000 reached by government agencies between January 1, 2012 and December 31, 2012. Twenty-two recipients (81.5 percent) had achieved all stated goals compared to five recipients (18.5 percent) that have yet to meet all of their obligations. The total value of the 22 projects that met all goals was \$2.1 million (81.8 percent) compared to \$0.4 million (18.2 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of public financial assistance was \$2.5 million. The project budget for those 27 projects totaled \$28.5 million of which \$2.5 million (21.4 percent) was provided by the public (Appendix E).

2011 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2011 activity on 39 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2011 and December 31, 2011. Twenty-six recipients (66.7 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to 13 recipients (33.3 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the 26 agreements that met all goals was \$16.4 million (63.5 percent) compared to \$9.4 million (36.5 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$25.8 million.

One eligible financial assistance agreement in excess of \$150,000 was reported by a government agency in 2013 for 2011 activity. The agency reported that the recipient had met all its goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement. Financial assistance totaled \$0.4 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2011 activity on 24 eligible financial assistance projects where the assistance was at or less than \$150,000 reached by government agencies between January 1, 2011 and December 31, 2011. Twenty recipients (83.3 percent) had achieved all stated goals compared to four recipients (16.7 percent) that have yet to meet all of their obligations. The total value of the 20 projects that met all goals was \$2.0 million (84.2 percent) compared to \$0.4 million (15.8 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of public financial assistance was \$2.4 million. The project budget for those 24 projects totaled \$12.9 million of which \$2.4 million (18.4 percent) was provided by the public (Appendix F).

2010 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2010 activity on 29 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2010 and December 31, 2010. Twenty-three recipients

(79.3 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to six recipients (20.7 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the 29 agreements that met all goals was \$15.5 million (77.4 percent) compared to \$4.5 million (22.6 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$20.0 million.

Government agencies reported on three eligible financial assistance agreements in excess of \$150,000 reported by government agencies in 2013 for 2010 activity. Agencies reported that all of the recipients had met all of their goals and obligations stipulated in the agreements. Financial assistance totaled \$2.3 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2010 activity on 16 eligible financial assistance projects where the assistance was at or less than \$150,000 reached by government agencies between January 1, 2010 and December 31, 2010. Thirteen recipients (81.3 percent) had achieved all stated goals compared to three recipients (18.8 percent) that have yet to meet all of their obligations. The total value of the 13 projects that met all goals was \$1.5 million compared to \$0.4 million that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of the public financial assistance was \$1.9 million. The project budget for those 16 projects totaled \$27.7 million of which \$1.9 million (6.7 percent) was provided by the public (Appendix G).

2009 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2009 activity on 20 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2009 and December 31, 2009. Eighteen recipients (90.0 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to two recipients (10.0 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of the 18 agreements that met all goals was \$26.4 million (97.8 percent) compared to \$0.6 million (2.2 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$27.0 million.

One eligible financial assistance agreement in excess of \$150,000 was reported by a government agency in 2013 for 2009 activity. The agency reported that the recipient had met all its goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement. Financial assistance provided totaled \$1.5 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2009 activity on 15 eligible financial assistance projects where the assistance was at or less than \$150,000 reached between January 1, 2009 and December 31, 2009. Thirteen recipients (86.7 percent) had achieved all stated goals compared to two recipients (13.3 percent) that have yet to meet all of their obligations. The total value of the 13 projects that met all goals was \$1.3 million (87.6 percent) compared to \$0.2 million (12.4 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The project budget for those 15 projects totaled \$17.8 million of which \$1.5 million (8.3 percent) was provided by the public (Appendix H).

2008 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2008 activity on 23 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2008 and December 31, 2008. Twenty-one recipients (91.3 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to two recipients (8.7 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of the 21 agreements that met all goals was \$13.4 million (96.8 percent) compared to \$0.5 million

(3.2 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$13.9 million.

One eligible financial assistance agreement in excess of \$150,000 was reported by a government agency in 2010 for 2008 activity. The agency reported in 2010 that the recipient had achieved all goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement. Financial assistance totaled \$0.7 million.

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2008 activity on 39 eligible financial assistance projects where the assistance was at or less than \$150,000 reached between January 1, 2008 and December 31, 2008. Thirty-seven recipients (94.9 percent) had achieved all stated goals compared to two recipients (5.1 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of the 37 projects was \$2.7 million (96.0 percent) compared to \$0.1 million (4.0 percent). The project budget for 39 projects totaled \$33.7 million; \$2.9 million (8.4 percent) was provided by the public (Appendix I).

2007 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2007 activity on 66 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2007 and December 31, 2007. Fifty-six recipients (84.8 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to 10 recipients (15.2 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of the 56 agreements that met all goals was \$16.8 million (37.2 percent) compared to \$28.5 million (62.8 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$45.3 million (Appendix J).

2006 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2006 activity on 61 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2006 and December 31, 2006. Fifty-five recipients (90.2 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to six recipients (9.8 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those 55 agreements that met all goals was \$26.4 million (91.3 percent) compared to \$2.5 million (8.7 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$28.9 million.

Seven eligible financial assistance agreements were reported by government agencies in 2013 for 2006 activity. Agencies reported that all of the recipients had met all their goals and obligations. Financial assistance totaled \$15.7 million (Appendix K).

2005 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2005 activity on 91 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2005 and December 31, 2005. Eighty recipients (87.9 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to 11 recipients (12.1 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those 80 agreements that met all goals was \$64.7 million (96.8 percent) compared to \$2.2 million (3.2 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$66.9 million.

Two eligible financial assistance agreements were reported by government agencies in 2016 for 2005 activity. One agency reported that the recipient had achieved all goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement and the other agency reported that the recipient had not yet achieved

all goals. The total value of the agreement was \$500,000 (12.5 percent) compared to \$3.5 million (87.5 percent) outstanding. Financial assistance totaled \$4.0 million (Appendix L).

2004 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2004 activity that 91 eligible business assistance agreements were reached between January 1, 2004 and December 31, 2004. Eighty-six recipients (94.5 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to five recipients (5.5 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those 86 agreements that met all goals was \$19.6 million (68.2 percent) compared to \$9.2 million (31.8 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$28.8 million.

Four eligible financial assistance agreements were reported by government agencies in 2005 and 2006 for 2004 activity. The agencies reported that all four recipients had achieved all goals and obligations stipulated in the agreements (Appendix M).

2003 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2003 activity on 100 eligible business assistance agreements between January 1, 2003 and December 31, 2003. Ninety-one recipients (91.0 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to nine recipients (9.0 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those 91 agreements that met all goals was \$34.7 million (91.3 percent) compared to \$3.3 million (8.7 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$38.0 million.

One eligible financial assistance agreement was reported by a government agency in 2004 for 2003 activity. The agency reported that the recipient had achieved all goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement (Appendix N).

2002 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2002 activity on 135 eligible business assistance agreements between January 1, 2002 and December 31, 2002. One hundred twenty recipients (88.9 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to 15 recipients (11.1 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those 120 agreements that met all goals was \$32.5 million (90.5 percent) compared to \$3.4 million (9.5 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$35.9 million.

Four eligible financial assistance agreements were reported by government agencies in 2002 through 2008 for 2002 activity. The four recipients had achieved all goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement (Appendix O).

2001 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2001 activity on 170 eligible business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2001 and December 31, 2001. One hundred forty-six recipients (85.9 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to 24 recipients (14.1 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those agreements that met all goals was \$97.3 million (94.1 percent) compared to \$6.1 million

(5.9 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$103.4 million.

Four eligible financial assistance agreements were reported by government agencies in 2002 through 2011 for 2001 activity. The four recipients had achieved all goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement (Appendix P).

2000 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 2000 activity on 196 eligible business assistance agreements were reached between January 1, 2000 and December 31, 2000. One hundred seventy-six recipients (89.8 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to 20 recipients (10.2 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those 176 agreements that met all goals was \$603.2 million compared to \$7.4 million (1.2 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$610.6 million.

Ten eligible financial assistance agreements were reported by government agencies in 2001 through 2011 for 2000 activity. The 10 recipients had achieved all goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement. Financial assistance totaled \$11.4 million (Appendix Q).

August 1, 1999 – December 31, 1999 Non-JOBZ Activity

Government agencies reported in 2016 for 1999 activity that 72 eligible business assistance agreements were reached between August 1, 1999 and December 31, 1999. Sixty-four recipients (88.9 percent) have achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to eight recipients (11.1 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those 64 agreements that met all goals was \$16.4 million (93.7 percent) compared to \$1.1 million (6.3 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$17.5 million.

One eligible financial assistance agreement was reported by a government agency in 2002 for 1999 activity. The recipient had achieved all goals and obligations stipulated in the agreement. Financial assistance totaled \$568,167 (Appendix R).

July 1, 1995 – July 31, 1999

Government agencies reported in 2000 through 2016 on 393 eligible business assistance agreements were reached between July 1, 1995 and July 31, 1999. Three hundred sixty-eight recipients (93.6 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations compared to 25 recipients (6.4 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of those 368 agreements that met all goals was \$161.0 million (92.4 percent) compared to \$13.3 million (7.6 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Business assistance totaled \$174.3 million (Appendix S).

Public Hearing and Adopted Criteria

According to M.S. §116J.994 business subsidies may not be granted until the grantor has held a public hearing and adopted criteria for awarding business subsidies. Grantors are also required to submit a copy of their adopted criteria policies to DEED if they award business subsidies.

Five hundred sixty-two agencies were required to hold a public hearing in or prior to 2016 in accordance with the statute because of population or previous activity (Appendix T). The distribution of agencies that reported holding a public hearing is as follows:

- 450 agencies or 80.1 percent reported holding a public hearing in compliance with the statute; and,
- 112 agencies or 19.9 percent did not report holding a public hearing on the MBAF.

Of the 562 agencies required to submit criteria to DEED, the distribution of the criteria submitted by agencies is as follows:

- 444 agencies or 79.0 percent submitted criteria; and,
- 118 agencies or 21.0 percent did not submit criteria.

Recipients that Failed to Fulfill All Goals and Obligations through 2015

Under the law, DEED is required to report the number of business assistance agreements for grantors that did not meet their goals for two years after the benefit date or until the goals are met, whichever is later. As of 2016, there were eight business assistance agreements reported by government agencies between August 1, 1999 and December 2015 in which recipients had failed to fulfill all goals and obligations. The total value of assistance awarded was \$1.5 million and the outstanding value of assistance subject to repayment was \$739,244 (Appendix U). For the same period, 63 business assistance agreements were terminated by government agencies. The total value of assistance awarded was \$46.6 million and the outstanding value of assistance subject to repayment was \$6.8 million (Appendix V).

Public Purpose for Assistance Agreements

Minnesota Statutes §116J.994 requires that business and financial assistance agreements state a public purpose. Fifty-nine public purposes were identified in 22 business assistance agreements entered into in 2016, because several agencies reported more than one public purpose for each project. Creating high quality job growth, 19 agreements (32.2 percent) and increasing the tax base, 16 agreements (27.1 percent) accounted for the largest share of public purposes reported by government agencies. Other public purposes included enhancing economic diversity and job retention, nine agreements (15.3 percent) each; and stabilizing the community, four agreements (6.8 percent) and other, two agreements (3.4 percent).

2015 Activity Findings

Forms summarized in this section of the report encompass business and financial assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015. Under the business subsidy law, agencies are required to submit a MBAF form for two years after the benefit date or until goals are met, whichever is later.

Of the 22 business assistance agreements reported by government agencies in 2015, the manufacturing sector accounted for 12 agreements (54.5 percent); service, six agreements (27.3 percent); retail trade, two agreements (9.1 percent) and other, two agreements (9.1 percent) (Table 2, Page 13).

TABLE 2
Distribution of Non-JOBZ Business Assistance Agreements by Industrial Sector for
Agreements Reached Between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015

Sector	Quantity	Percentage	Dollar Amount (in millions)	Percentage
Manufacturing	12	54.5%	\$9.8	70.3%
Service	6	27.3%	\$2.2	15.7%
Retail Trade	2	9.1%	\$1.1	7.7%
Other	2	9.1%	\$0.9	6.3%
Total	22	100.0%	\$14.0	100.0%

Of the \$14.0 million in business assistance provided by government agencies, the manufacturing sector accounted for \$9.8 million (70.3 percent); service, \$2.2 million (15.7 percent); retail trade, \$1.1 million (7.7 percent) and other, 0.9 million (6.3 percent).

Distribution of Assistance Agreements

Cities accounted for most of the business assistance agreements reported in 2016. Table 3 shows the distribution of the 22 business subsidy agreements on the MBAF. Cities accounted for 20 agreements (90.9 percent); and counties for two agreements (9.1 percent).

TABLE 3
Distribution of Non-JOBZ Business Assistance by Government Agency for Agreements
Reached Between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015

Grantor Classification	Quantity	Percentage	Dollar Amount (in millions)	Percentage
City ²	20	90.9%	\$12.9	91.9%
County	2	9.1%	\$1.1	8.1%
Total	22	100.0%	\$14.0	100.0%

Of the \$14.0 million in business subsidies reported on the MBAF, city agencies accounted for \$12.9 million (91.9 percent) and county agencies accounted for \$1.1 million (8.1 percent).

Regional Distribution of Assistance Agreements

The Twin Cities and Central regions accounted for the most business assistance reported in 2016. As Table 4 shows, of the 22 business assistance agreements reported in 2016, the Twin Cities region accounted for nine agreements (40.9 percent); Central region, eight agreements (36.4 percent); Southeast region, four agreements (18.2 percent); and Southwest region, one agreement (4.5 percent).

²City includes housing redevelopment authorities (HRAs).

TABLE 4
Regional Distribution of Non-JOBZ Business Assistance Agreements
Reached Between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015

Region	Quantity	Percentage	Dollar Amount (in millions)	Percentage
Twin Cities	9	40.9%	\$7.4	52.5%
Central	8	36.4%	\$4.3	30.5%
Southeast	4	18.2%	\$2.0	14.8%
Southwest	1	4.5%	\$0.3	2.1%
Total	22	100.0%	\$14.0	100.0%

Of the \$14.0 million of business subsidies reported in 2016 by government agencies, the Twin Cities region provided about \$7.4 million (52.5 percent); Central region, \$4.3 million (30.5 percent); Southeast region, \$2.0 million (14.8 percent); and Southwest region, \$0.3 million (2.1 percent).

Type and Value of Assistance Provided

Of the \$14.0 million in subsidies awarded by state, county and local government agencies, amounts ranged from \$27,000 for a grant to a \$1.9 million tax increment financing (TIF). The median value was \$500,000 for agreements awarded.

TIF and tax abatements were the most common types of subsidies provided. Of the 22 business subsidies reported by government agencies, there were 27 types of business subsidies reported because several agencies reported more than one type of assistance for each project. As Table 5 illustrates, of the 27 types of business subsidies reported by government agencies, TIF was involved in nine (33.3 percent) agreements and tax abatements were involved in six agreements (22.2 percent).

TIF accounted for the most assistance provided \$6.7 million (47.9 percent), followed by tax abatements, \$3.6 million (25.5 percent).

TABLE 5
Distribution of Non-JOBZ Business Assistance Agreements Reached
Between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015

Type	Quantity	Percentage	Dollar Amount (in millions)	Percentage
TIF	9	33.3%	\$6.7	47.9%
Tax Abatement	6	22.2%	\$3.6	25.5%
Grant	5	18.5%	\$1.7	12.1%
Loan	4	14.8%	\$1.1	8.1%
Land Contribution	2	7.4%	\$0.7	5.2%
Contribution of Property	1	3.7%	\$0.2	1.3%
Total	27	100.0%	\$14.0	100.0%

Goals and Actual Performance

Grantors are required to identify the types of goals that recipients receiving business assistance were expected to achieve. Grantors are also required to indicate their progress.

Under the law, if the assistance agreement includes specific wage and job goals, those goals must be attained within two years of the benefit date. Assistance agreements can also include other goals. Of the 22 eligible business assistance agreements entered into by agencies between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015, 17 agreements (77.3 percent) established specific job and wage goals.

Of the 17 business assistance agreements that were reported by agencies that established specific wage goals, three agreements (17.6 percent) have attained specific job and wage goals; and 14 agreements (82.4 percent) reported that the recipient had not attained specific job and wage goals. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals.

Nine business assistance agreements established other job creation and/or retention goals. Two agreements (22.2 percent) had attained their goals and seven agreements (77.8 percent) had not attained their goals. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals.

Four business assistance agreements established other wage goals. Two agreements (50.0 percent) had attained their goals and two agreements (50 percent) had not attained their goals. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals.

Six business assistance agreements established goals other than wage and job goals. Of the six agreements reported by agencies that established goals other than wage and job goals, one agreement (16.7 percent) had attained their goals and five agreements (83.3 percent) had not attained their goals. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals.

Actual Performance

Of the 22 business assistance agreements reached between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015, four recipients (18.2 percent) had achieved all stipulated goals and obligations, compared to 18 recipients (81.8 percent) that have yet to achieve all goals and obligations. Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their goals and obligations. The total value of the four agreements that met all goals was \$2.8 million (20.3 percent) compared to \$11.2 million (79.7 percent) that had yet to achieve all goals and obligations. The total value of business assistance was \$14.0 million.

Full-time Job Creation and Wages

The business assistance agreement must include goals for the number of jobs created, which may include separate goals for wages and the number of full-time or part-time jobs created.

Of the 22 eligible business assistance agreements, agencies reported a full-time job creation goal of 815 jobs with an average hourly health and non-health benefit ranging between \$1.42 and \$9.19 (Table 6). Agencies reported 402 actual full-time jobs created and that recipients had more time to meet their job creation and wage goals. The distribution of full-time job creation and wage goals and actual performance can be seen in Table 6.

TABLE 6
Distribution of Non-JOBZ Full-time Job Creation, Wage Goals and Actual Performance for Agreements Reached Between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015

Goals					Actual			
Hourly Wage	Average Hourly Health Benefit	Average Hourly Non-Health Benefit	Number of Jobs	Percentage	Average Hourly Health Benefit	Average Hourly Non-Health Benefit	Number of Jobs	Percentage
No Hourly Wage	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
Less than \$7.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$7.00 to \$8.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$9.00 to \$10.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	76	9.3%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$11.00 to \$12.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	39	4.8%	\$1.87	\$1.00	31	7.7%
\$13.00 to \$14.99	\$4.42	\$0.00	442	54.2%	\$2.95	\$0.00	35	8.7%
\$15.00 to \$16.99	\$6.58	\$3.73	120	14.7%	\$5.33	\$3.35	17	4.2%
\$17.00 to \$18.99	\$6.58	\$4.15	17	2.1%	\$3.37	\$3.54	30	7.5%
\$19.00 to \$20.99	\$6.58	\$4.42	64	7.9%	\$4.50	\$2.58	45	5.7%
\$21.00 to \$22.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	6	0.7%	\$3.35	\$2.70	23	3.5%
\$23.00 to \$24.99	\$6.23	\$1.42	21	2.6%	\$3.80	\$2.61	14	6.7%
\$25.00 to \$26.99	\$5.82	\$4.51	7	0.9%	\$4.08	\$5.26	27	8.2%
\$27.00 to \$28.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	3	0.4%	\$5.19	\$5.86	33	9.5%
\$29.00 to \$30.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	5	0.6%	\$4.35	\$0.00	38	0.0%
\$31.00 & higher	\$5.61	\$9.19	15	1.8%	\$6.02	\$5.80	109	27.1%
Total	\$5.97	\$4.57	815	100.0%	\$4.07	\$3.60	402	100.0%

Part-time Job Creation and Wages

Of the 22 eligible business assistance agreements, agencies reported a part-time job creation goal of 11 jobs. Agencies reported one actual part-time job. The distribution of part-time job creation, wage goals and actual performance can be seen in Table 7.

TABLE 7
Distribution of Non-JOBZ Part-time Job Creation, Wage Goals and Actual Performance for Agreements Reached Between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015

Goals					Actual			
Hourly Wage	Average Hourly Health Benefit	Average Hourly Non-Health Benefit	Number of Jobs	Percentage	Average Hourly Health Benefit	Average Hourly Non-Health Benefit	Number of Jobs	Percentage
No Hourly Wage	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
Less than \$7.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$7.00 to \$8.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$9.00 to \$10.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	10	90.9%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$11.00 to \$12.99	\$1.13	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$13.00 to \$14.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$15.00 to \$16.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$17.00 to \$18.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$19.00 to \$20.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	1	9.1%	\$0.00	\$0.00	1	100.0%
\$21.00 to \$22.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$23.00 to \$24.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$25.00 to \$26.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$27.00 to \$28.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$29.00 to \$30.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$31.00 & higher	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
Total	\$1.13	\$0.00	11	100.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	1	100.0%

Job Retention Goals and Actual Performance

Of the 22 eligible business assistance agreements, agencies reported a job retention goal of 503 jobs. Agencies reported 317 jobs retained (Table 8). Agencies reported that recipients had more time to meet their job retention goals. The distribution of retained job goals, wages and actual performance can be seen in Table 8.

TABLE 8
Distribution of Non-JOBZ Job Retention Goals, Wages and Actual Performance for Agreements Reached Between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2015

Goals					Actual			
Hourly Wage	Average Hourly Health Benefit	Average Hourly Non-Health Benefit	Number of Jobs	Percentage	Average Hourly Health Benefit	Average Hourly Non-Health Benefit	Number of Jobs	Percentage
No Hourly Wage	\$0.00	\$0.00	13	2.6%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
Less than \$7.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$7.00 to \$8.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$9.00 to \$10.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$11.00 to \$12.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	10	2.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$13.00 to \$14.99	\$4.46	\$0.00	215	42.7%	\$2.95	\$0.00	215	67.8%
\$15.00 to \$16.99	\$6.58	\$3.73	220	43.7%	\$5.33	\$3.35	95	30.0%
\$17.00 to \$18.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$3.37	\$3.54	3	0.9%
\$19.00 to \$20.99	\$6.71	\$5.85	45	8.9%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$21.00 to \$22.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$3.35	\$2.70	1	0.3%
\$23.00 to \$24.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$3.80	\$2.61	1	0.3%
\$25.00 to \$26.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	1	0.2%	\$4.08	\$5.26	1	0.3%
\$27.00 to \$28.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$5.19	\$5.86	1	0.3%
\$29.00 to \$30.99	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
\$31.00 & higher	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%	\$0.00	\$0.00	0	0.0%
Total	\$5.92	\$4.79	503	100.0%	\$4.01	\$3.89	317	100.0%

2016 Business Assistance Report Appendices

Report to the Legislature

Summary of Business and Financial Assistance Reported
By State and Local Government Agencies Provided Between
July 1, 1995 and December 31, 2015
In Accordance With
Minnesota Statutes § 116J.993 through § 116J.995

(Report Available Under Separate Cover)

December 2016

Edwin Hodder
Economic Analyst
Economic Analysis Unit
Minnesota Department of Employment and Economic Development

Total cost of salaries, printing, and supplies in
developing/preparing this report is \$27,113.84
(reported as required by Minn. Stat. 3.197)

LIST OF APPENDICES

- Appendix A: Listing of Agencies Required to Submit a 2016 MBAF
- Appendix B: Summary of 2015 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix C: Summary of 2014 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix D: Summary of 2013 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix E: Summary of 2012 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix F: Summary of 2011 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix G: Summary of 2010 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix H: Summary of 2009 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix I: Summary of 2008 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix J: Summary of 2007 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix K: Summary of 2006 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix L: Summary of 2005 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix M: Summary of 2004 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix N: Summary of 2003 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix O: Summary of 2002 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix P: Summary of 2001 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix Q: Summary of 2000 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix R: Summary of 1999 (August 1 - December 31, 1999) Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix S: Summary of July 1, 1995 - July 31, 1999 Non-JOBZ Business Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016
- Appendix T: Listing of Agencies that Held a Public Hearing and Adopted Criteria Per M.S. 116J.993 - M.S. 116J.995
- Appendix U: Summary of August 1, 1999 - December 31, 2015 Business Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies that Failed to Fulfill all Goals and Obligations in 2000 through 2015
- Appendix V: Summary of August 1, 1999 – December 31, 2015 Business Assistance Agreements that were Terminated by Government Agencies in 2000 through 2016

Appendix A:

Listing of Agencies Required to Submit a 2016 MBAF

Appendix B:

Summary of 2015 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix C:

Summary of 2014 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix D:

Summary of 2013 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix E:

Summary of 2012 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix F:

Summary of 2011 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance
Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix G:

Summary of 2010 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance
Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix H:

Summary of 2009 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance
Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix I:

Summary of 2008 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix J:

Summary of 2007 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance
Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix K:

Summary of 2006 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix L:

Summary of 2005 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix M:

Summary of 2004 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance
Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix N:

Summary of 2003 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance
Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix O:

Summary of 2002 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix P:

Summary of 2001 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance
Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix Q:

Summary of 2000 Non-JOBZ Business and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix R:

Summary of 1999 (August 1 - December 31, 1999) Non-JOBZ Business
and Financial Assistance Agreements Reported by
Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix S:

Summary of July 1, 1995 - July 31, 1999 Non-JOBZ Business
Assistance Agreements Reported by
Government Agencies in 2016

Appendix T:

Listing of Agencies that Held a Public Hearing
and Adopted Criteria Per M.S. 116J.993 - M.S. 116J.995

Appendix U:

Summary of August 1, 1999 - December 31, 2015 Business
Assistance Agreements Reported by
Government Agencies that Failed to Fulfill
all Goals and Obligations in 2000 through 2015

Appendix V:

Summary of August 1, 1999 – December 31, 2015 Business
Assistance Agreements that were Terminated
by Government Agencies in 2000 through 2016